



MINUTES

Meeting: **Planning Committee**

Date: Friday 9 September 2016 at 10.00 am

Venue: Board Room, Aldern House, Baslow Road, Bakewell

Chair: Mr P Ancell

Present: Cllr D Birkinshaw, Cllr P Brady, Cllr C Carr, Cllr D Chapman, Cllr A Hart, Mr R Helliwell, Cllr Mrs C Howe, Cllr H Laws, Cllr J Macrae, Cllr Mrs K Potter, Cllr Mrs L C Roberts, Cllr Mrs J A Twigg and Cllr D Williams

Cllr A McCloy and Cllr F J Walton attended to observe and speak but not vote.

Apologies for absence: Ms S McGuire.

114/16 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING OF 12 AUGUST 2016

The minutes of the last meeting of the Planning Committee held on 12 August 2016 were approved as a correct record subject to an amendment to minute 105/16 to clarify that the sign is in the car park and not about the car park.

The Director of Conservation and Planning updated Members regarding the planning appeal for Warren Lodge which has now been determined and allowed. The applicant now has two approved applications and can decide which to proceed with.

In response to Member comments it was confirmed that item 102/16 and 106/16 will now return to a later committee.

115/16 MEMBERS DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Item 6

Cllr Mrs Kath Potter declared a personal interest as she is a member of CPRE and Friend of the Peak District who had supplied comments on the report.

Item 7

Cllr Mrs Kath Potter declared a personal interest as she is a member of CPRE and Friends of the Peak District who have supplied comments on the report.

Mr Robert Helliwell declared a personal interest as he knows the applicant.

The agent for this application was a former officer at the National Park Authority and was known to many of the Members.

Item 8 & 9

Cllr Mrs Judith Twigg declared a personal interest as she knows the applicant but has not discussed the application with them.

Mr Robert Helliwell declared a personal interest as he knows the applicant.

Item 10

As the application was on behalf of the Authority the individuals involved were known to members.

Item 11

Cllr Mrs Lesley Roberts declared a personal interest as she had spoken to the Chairman of Upper Hulme Parish Council but did not give an opinion. Cllr Mrs Roberts also knows the applicants.

Item 12

Cllr John Walton declared a personal interest as Mr & Mrs Danks are members of his ward.

Mr Robert Helliwell declared a personal interest as he knows the applicant.

Item 13

Cllr David Chapman declared a personal interest as he had visited the site as Member Representative for Enforcement as an observer.

116/16 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Nine members of the public were present to make representations to the Committee.

117/16 OUTLINE APPLICATION - CONSTRUCTION OF NEW EMPLOYMENT BUILDING, ASSOCIATED LANDSCAPING OPERATIONS AND ACCESS IMPROVEMENTS, BACKDALE QUARRY, HASSOP ROAD, HASSOP

Members had visited the site on the previous day.

The Officer confirmed that this was an outline application and therefore no detailed plans were available. Following discussions between the applicant and Officers the size of the proposed building had been reduced, there were no sustainable reasons for refusal on highways grounds and no major landscape impact therefore Officers recommended approval.

The following spoke under the Public Participation at Meetings Scheme:

- Barry Anderton, Objector
- Mr Church, Agent

Members requested a change to condition 6 to remove the wording 'associated with the use of the building', Officers agreed to this change.

Members discussed the relocation of the building to increase screening from the road, location of the building in relation to the lawful development certificate, demolition of the current building and the timing of that demolition.

The officer recommendation to approve the application subject to the following changes to the conditions was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried:

- Detailed siting of the building within the site.
- Condition 4 (i) at top of page 3 shall include the wording 'clearance works to include timing of removal'.
- Additional condition – 'no work on the new building shall take place prior to the demolition of the existing industrial building, subject to condition 4 above'.
- Changes to condition 6 as stated above.

Further discussions between the Officer and the applicant will take place prior to the submission of the reserved matters application regarding the location of the new building with a view to minimising the visual impact.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with Drawing No. CL.206312.106 Revision A received by the National Park Authority on 11 August 2016 subject to the following conditions or modifications:**
- 2. Prior to the commencement of any part of the development hereby permitted, approval of Reserved Matters relating to the following details shall be obtained from the National Park Authority:**
 - i. The layout of the proposed development (including parking and manoeuvring areas)**
 - ii. The design and external appearance of the proposed development (including materials and external finishes)**
 - iii. Landscaping treatment of the site which shall not be in conflict with, or seek to amend the requirements of the scheme on 'Plan 2' attached to the Prohibition Order (including the retention of existing trees, boundary treatments and precise details of any planting schemes and surfacing materials)**

All such applications shall be made within three years of the date of this permission. Thereafter, the development shall be carried out as approved and begun three years from the date of this permission, or two years from final approval of all Reserved Matters, whichever is the later.

3. The detailed scheme shall provide for a single building with a maximum ridge height of 12 metres above the adjacent ground levels and a maximum floor area of 1000m² (measured externally), the design of which shall closely reflect the appearance of a modern portal framed agricultural building in terms of form, detailed design and materials including the provision of timber cladding above a stone plinth for the external walls of the building and a profile sheeted roof factory coloured dark slate blue.
4. No development shall take place, including any works of demolition, until a Construction Method Statement has been submitted to, and approved in writing by, the local planning authority. The approved Statement shall be adhered to throughout the construction period. The Statement shall provide for:
 - i. the parking of vehicles of site operatives and visitors
 - ii. loading and unloading of plant and materials
 - iii. storage of plant and materials used in constructing the development
 - iv. the erection and maintenance of security hoarding
 - v. wheel washing facilities
 - vi. measures to control the emission of dust and dirt during construction
 - vii. a scheme for recycling/disposing of waste resulting from demolition and construction works

The Statement shall also include precise details of:

- i. site clearance works to include timing of removal and a schedule of all items within the area covered by the pre-existing Certificate of lawful Use to be removed or demolished;
 - ii. all earthworks associated with the construction of the building hereby permitted
 - iii. mitigation measures to avoid disturbance or harm to reptiles and birds
 - iv. connections to services and means of foul water disposal
 - v. external lighting (including details of luminosity)
 - vi. a watching brief (with regard to safeguarding fossil remains) unless otherwise agreed in writing by the National Park Authority in liaison with Natural England
5. No work on the new building shall take place prior to the demolition of the existing industrial building, subject to condition 4 above.
6. The building hereby permitted shall not be taken into use until the means of vehicular access has been constructed and completed in accordance with plans to be first submitted to and agreed in writing by the National Park Authority. The said means of vehicular access shall thereafter be retained for access purposes only and the approved visibility splays shall be maintained free of any obstruction to their designated purpose throughout the lifetime of the development hereby permitted.

7. **The building hereby permitted shall not be taken into use until a bin store, and area/facilities allocated for storing of other waste and recyclable materials have been completed in accordance with plans to be first submitted to and agreed in writing by the National Park Authority. Thereafter, there shall be no outdoor storage of any items anywhere on the land hereby permitted other than in the areas designated for bin storage and storage of other waste and recyclable materials.**
8. **The amended Travel Plan shall be implemented on the commencement of the use of the building hereby permitted and thereafter, the occupier of the building shall submit a monitoring and evaluation report to the National Park Authority, which assesses compliance with the Travel Plan, on each anniversary of the commencement of the use of the building for the following five years. Any recommendations made in the reports submitted to the National Park Authority shall be implemented in the following year subject to the written agreement of the National Park Authority and any recommendations made by the Authority in the event of traffic movements from the development demonstrably having a severe impact on the local road network shall be implemented by the occupier of the building within three months of notification of these recommendations by the Authority.**
9. **The restoration of the quarry outside of the area covered by the pre-existing Certificate of Lawful Use shall be carried out in complete accordance with the restoration scheme approved under the Prohibition Order other than in respects of any minor works expressly consented by the National Park Authority in pursuance of the discharge any of the above conditions.**
10. **Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (England) Order 2015 (or any Order revoking and/or re-enacting that Order) the building hereby permitted shall only be used for employment purposes associated with a use falling within B1, B2 or B8 of the Schedule to the Town and Country Planning (Use Classes) Order 1987 or any provision equivalent to that Class in any Statutory Instrument revoking and/or re-enacting that Order) and for no other purposes at any time during the lifetime of the development hereby permitted.**
11. **Roadside trees to be retained as part of the site landscaping.**

The meeting was adjourned from 11.00 to 11.05 following consideration of this item

Cllr Patrick Brady joined the meeting at 10.35 but took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

118/16 FULL APPLICATION - ERECTION OF AGRICULTURAL BUILDING, CLIFFE HOUSE FARM, LOXLEY ROAD, BRADFELD, SHEFFIELD

Members had visited the site on the previous day.

In introducing the report the Officer pointed out an error in Condition 6 which should also include the painting of the north elevation of the building.

The photo montage used as part of the Officer presentation had been supplied by the applicant and did not include the raised bunding which had subsequently been discussed with officers.

There had been a previous application on 2012 for two new buildings which had been refused, appealed and the Authority's decision to refuse had been upheld by the inspector.

The following spoke under the Public Participation at Meetings Scheme:

- Mrs Barbara Wardley, Objector
- Jan Symmington, Objector

It was noted that the present building already had an impact on the landscape and all the reasons specified by the Planning Inspector when refusing the previous application still stand even though this is now only one building. The large scale landscaping needed to reduce the impact of the buildings and the storage of large amounts of waste products from the cattle kept in the sheds could have an environmental impact on the yard and surrounding land. No consultation has taken place with the water company to check on the impact of the earth works on the water table.

A motion for refusal contrary to the officer recommendation based on the points noted in the Planning Inspector's report at point 14, 17, 18, 26 and 29 and including the last sentence of point 25 '*Overall it seems to me that the benefits outlined include a small public benefit. However, it is not sufficient to outweigh the harm that I have identified.*' was moved and seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be REFUSED for the following reasons:

The impact of this major development in a National Park is not outweighed by public benefits, the scale and design of building and associated works, and the impact on landscape and setting of a listed building.

119/16 FULL APPLICATION - INSTALLATION OF A DISABLED ACCESS CAMPING POD WITH SURFACED PARKING AND WHEELCHAIR ACCESSIBLE PATHWAY TO CAMPSITE BUILDING AND INSTALLATION OF TWO CAMPING PODS IN THE NORTH EAST OF THE CAMPSITE AT NORTH LEES CAMPSITE, HATHERSAGE

Members had visited the site on the previous day.

The Officer reported receipt of a letter in support of the application which had been received after the completion of the report.

The following spoke under the Public Participation at Meetings Scheme:

- Rebekah Newman, applicant

Members of the Committee congratulated the management of the site on the 'good fit' with the landscaping and the welcome addition of the facility for disabled visitors.

The Officer recommendation to approve the application was moved and seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions or modifications.

1. **Statutory three year time limit for implementation.**
2. **Development to be carried out in accordance with specified approved plans.**
3. **The camping pods shall not be sited anywhere within the application site other than in accordance with the plots identified on the approved plans.**
4. **No camping pod shall be replaced with any other structure or caravan at any time.**
5. **Restrict occupancy of camping pods to short term holiday letting purposes (no more than 28 days occupancy by any individual per calendar year) ancillary to North Lees Campsite. The camping pods and the existing campsite shall be retained within a single planning unit.**
6. **The roof tiles and external finish of the pods shall match the existing camping pods.**
7. **All new service lines associated with the approved development, and on land with the applicant's ownership and control, shall be placed underground and the ground restored to its original condition thereafter.**
8. **There shall be no external lighting on the camping pods hereby approved and the camping pods and associated land shall not be provided with any other external source of illumination at any time.**
9. **No trees shall be felled within the area proposed to site the two camping pods in the north eastern corner of the site other than in accordance with a details scheme (to include details and timing of any tree to be felled and subsequent species, size and location of any new planting) which shall have first been submitted to and approved by the National Park Authority.**

120/16 FULL APPLICATION - NEW GARDEN SHED AND PORCH AT STATION HOUSE, STATION ROAD, UPPER PADLEY, GRINDLEFORD

The Officer recommendation for approval subject to conditions was moved, seconded, voted on and carried.

RESOLVED

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

1. **The development shall be carried out in accordance with specified approved plans.**
2. **The window and door frames to the porch shall be finished to match the existing conservatory.**
3. **The stone work for the porch shall be natural gritstone, faced, coursed, laid and pointed to match the existing dwelling.**

- 4. Notwithstanding the submitted plans no planning permission is granted for any change of use within the application site or any alterations or extensions to buildings within the application site other than in relation to the proposed porch and garden shed.**

121/16 S.73 APPLICATION - FOR THE REMOVAL OR ALTERATION TO CONDITION 4 (HOLIDAY OCCUPANCY CONDITION) FROM PLANNING CONSENT NP/SM/0106/0032, OLD DAINS MILL, UPPER HULME

Cllr Andrew Hart declared that he knew the applicants and left the room during discussion of this item due to a prejudicial interest.

The following spoke under the Public Participation at Meetings Scheme:

- Mr Brian Bell, applicant

Members noted that there may be other viable options to preserve this heritage asset including conversion to more than one affordable home. Members supported the removal of the condition but not to allow open market sale of a large dwelling.

The Officer recommendation for refusal was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be REFUSED for the following reasons:

- 1. The proposal fails to meet the requirements of Core Strategy Policy HC1(C) and national planning policies because the removal of the planning condition is not required in order to achieve conservation of the mill building and adjacent store house, and the proposals would not otherwise achieve any significant enhancements to the character and appearance of the building or its landscape setting.**

Cllr Andrew Hart returned to the meeting.

122/16 FULL APPLICATION - FIRST FLOOR EXTENSION AND GROUND FLOOR KITCHEN EXTENSION AT ROTHERWOOD, WEST LEES ROAD, BAMFORD

Members had driven past the site the previous day.

The following spoke under the Public Participation at Meetings Scheme:

- Cllr Sue Beckett, Chair Bamford Parish Council, Supporter
- Mrs Aline Danks, Applicant

Members were minded to approve the motion contrary to officer recommendation as there were no objections from the neighbour whose home is closest to the extension.

The motion for approval contrary to officer recommendation was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried. Officers were asked to apply appropriate conditions without further reports to the Committee.

RESOLVED

That the application be APPROVED subject to conditions.

Cllr David Chapman was not present for the discussion on this item.

123/16 FULL APPLICATION - REAR EXTENSION TO PROVIDE HALL, STUDIO, STAIR TO BASEMENT AND EN-SUITE AT A HALF LEVEL. REFURBISHMENT OF BASEMENT AND CONVERSION TO HABITABLE SPACE INCLUDING RESTORATION OF ORIGINAL WINDOW OPENINGS,. REGRADING OF LAWN AND ACCESS TO BASEMENT DOOR. HALL COTTAGE, BAULK LANE, HATHERSAGE

Members had visited the site on the previous day.

Item 14 & 15 were discussed together.

In introducing the report the Officer stated that the agent had been in touch to confirm that the applicant would be happy to discuss conditions on the detailed comments as follows:

- Detailed window frames
- Floor level – relaying of original floor once level changed
- Retaining features in cellar and covering of walls.

In accordance with the Authority's Standing Orders, the meeting voted to continue its business beyond three hours.

The following spoke under the Public Participation at Meetings Scheme:

- Simon Gedye, Agent

Members noted that some form of extension to the rear of the building, in keeping with the Georgian lean-to which is already in place, may be possible but this would require a new planning application as this would not be a minor change to the submitted plans.

The Officer recommendation for refusal was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be REFUSED for the following reason.

1. **The proposed development would harm the significance of Hall Cottage (Grade II listed), the setting of Further House (Grade II listed) and the designated Hathersage Conservation Area. In the absence of any public benefits which could outweigh the harm that has been identified it is therefore considered that approval of the proposals would be contrary to Core Strategy policy GSP3 and L3, Local Plan policies LC4, LC5, LC6 and LH4 and the National Planning Policy Framework.**

124/16 LISTED BUILDING CONSENT APPLICATION - REAR EXTENSION TO PROVIDE HALL, STUDIO, STAIR TO BASEMENT AND EN-SUITE AT A HALF LEVEL. REFURBISHMENT OF BASEMENT AND CONVERSION TO HABITABLE SPACE INCLUDING RESTORATION OF ORIGINAL WINDOW OPENINGS,. REGRADING OF

LAWN AND ACCESS TO BASEMENT DOOR. HALL COTTAGE, BAULK LANE, HATHERSAGE

Members had visited the site on the previous day.

The Officer recommendation for refusal was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be REFUSED for the following reason.

- 1. The proposed works would harm the significance of Hall Cottage (Grade II listed), and the setting of Further House (Grade II listed). In the absence of any public benefits which could outweigh the harm that has been identified it is therefore considered that approval of the proposals would be contrary to Core Strategy policy L3, Local Plan policy LC6 and the National Planning Policy Framework.**

The meeting was adjourned at 13.30 for a lunch break and reconvened at 14.00

Chair: Mr P Ancell

Present: Cllr D Birkinshaw, Cllr P Brady, Cllr C Carr,
Cllr D Chapman, Cllr A Hart, Mr R Helliwell,
Cllr Mrs C Howe, Cllr H Laws, Cllr J Macrae,
Cllr Mrs K Potter, Cllr Mrs L C Roberts,
Cllr Mrs J A Twigg and Cllr D Williams

Cllr A McCloy and Cllr F J Walton attended to observe and speak but not vote.

Apologies for absence: Ms S McGuire and Cllr A Hart.

125/16 LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN ANNUAL MONITORING REPORT FOR 2015/16

The Director of Conservation and Planning reminded members that there are Planning Training sessions on 30 September and 28 October, all Planning Committee Members need to attend one of these sessions and there will be further discussion of the Local Development Plan and policies at each.

It was noted that some minor changes were needed to the text on pages 115 & 119.

The motion to approve the report subject to the stated amendments was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

Members agreed the Annual Monitoring Report for 2015/16 subject to amendments agreed.

126/16 HEAD OF LAW REPORT - PLANNING APPEALS

The motion to receive the report was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the report be received.

The meeting ended at 2.35 pm